

Message Text

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 MANILA 10853 01 OF 02 140914Z

ACTION EA-09

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 AS-01 DHA-02 CIAE-00 NSAE-00
NSCE-00 SSO-00 USIE-00 INRE-00 PM-04 H-01 INR-07
L-03 NSC-05 PA-01 PRS-01 SP-02 SS-15 /052 W
-----048663 140925Z /13

O 140845Z JUL 77

FM AMEMBASSY MANILA

TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 2350

DEPTJUSTICE WASHDC IMMEDIATE

INFO CSAF(JACI) IMMEDIATE

CINCPAC IMMEDIATE

CINCPACAF IMMEDIATE

13AF CLARK IMMEDIATE

3CSG CLARK IMMEDIATE

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 1 OF 2 MANILA 10853

JUSTICE FOR RISTAU/FOREIGN LITIGATION UNIT

E. O. 11652: GDS

TAGS: MILI, RP

SUBJECT: PROPOSED REPLY TO DFA PROTEST ON NUGUID CIVIL SUIT

REF: MANILA 10772, DTG PR 140105Z JUL 77

1. EMBASSY PLANS REPLY ALONG FOLLOWING LINES ON 15 JULY
TO DFA IN RESPONSE TO NOTE TRANSMITTED REFTEL. QUOTE:

THE EMBASSY OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA PRESENTS
ITS COMPLIMENTS TO THE DEPARTMENT OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS OF
THE REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES AND HAS THE HONOR TO REFER
TO THE DEPRATMENT'S NOTE NO. 2044-77 CONCERNING A NEWS
ITEM UNDER THE HEADING OF "CLARK REJECTS SUMMONSES ON THREE
SERVICEMEN" WHICH APPEARED ON THE FRONT PAGE OF THE
TIMES JOURNAL OF 11 JULY 1977.

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 MANILA 10853 01 OF 02 140914Z

THE EMBASSY HAS BEEN ASSURED AND IS CONVINCED THAT
THE BASE AUTHORITIES HAVE NO INTENTION OF VIOLATING THE
PROVISIONS OF THE US-RP MILITARY BASES AGREEMENT. AS
THE DEPARTMENT'S NOTE SUGGESTS, SERVICE OF PROCESS IS
ORDINARILY HANDLED IN A ROUTINE AND MUTUALLY
SATISFACTORY MANNER IN CONFORMANCE TO THE MILITARY BASES
AGREEMENT WHICH IS MERELY ONE DEMONSTRATION OF THE

RESPECT THAT BASE AUTHORITIES HAVE, AS THEY SHOULD, FOR
THE JURISDICTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS BETWEEN OUR GOVERNMENTS.

THE EMBASSY UNDERSTANDS, HOWEVER, THAT THE LAWSUIT
IN QUESTION DIFFERS FROM THE NORMAL PRIVATE ACTION
IN SEVERAL SIGNIFICANT ASPECTS. UNLIKE THE TYPICAL
SUIT, THE UNITED STATES GOVERNMENT IS SPECIFICALLY
NAMED AS A DEFENDANT WHICH WOULD INDICATE THE APPROPRIATE-
NESS OF SERVICE THROUGH THE DEPARTMENT OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS
IN ACCORDANCE WITH CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL PRACTICE.
MOREOVER, WE UNDERSTAND THAT THE SERVICEMEN INVOLVED
WERE ALLEGED BY COMPLAINANT TO HAVE BEEN ACTING IN
THEIR OFFICIAL CAPACITIES AS EMPLOYEES AND AGENTS OF
THE UNITED STATES GOVERNMENT. IT WOULD THEREFORE APPEAR
THAT THE COMPLAINANT'S ACTION ON ITS FACE IS, IN EFFECT,
DIRECTED AT THE UNITED STATES GOVERNMENT AND CONSTITUTES
ADDITIONAL JUSTIFICATION FOR SERVICE THROUGH THE
DEPARTMENT.

IN LIGHT OF THIS ADDITIONAL INFORMATION, THE
DEPARTMENT WOULD NO DOUBT AGREE THAT IT IS DIFFICULT

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 MANILA 10853 02 OF 02 140920Z
ACTION EA-09

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 CIAE-00 NSAE-00 NSCE-00 SSO-00
USIE-00 INRE-00 PM-04 H-01 INR-07 L-03 NSC-05
PA-01 PRS-01 SP-02 SS-15 /049 W
-----048708 140925Z /13

O 140845Z JUL 77

FM AMEMBASSY MANILA

TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 2351

DEPTJUSTICE WASHDC IMMEDIATE

INFO CSAF(JACI) IMMEDIATE

CINCPAC IMMEDIATE

CINCPACAF IMMEDIATE

13AF CLARK IMMEDIATE

3CSG CLARK IMMEDIATE

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 2 OF 2 MANILA 10853

JUSTICE FOR RISTAU/FOREIGN LITIGATION UNIT

TO COMPARE THW LAWSUIT IN QUESTION TO ACTIONS OF A

PURELY PRIVATE NATURE BROUGHT BY LANDLORDS FOR RENT OR DEPENDENT WIVES FOR SUPPORT AGAINST INDIVIDUALS IN THEIR PERSONAL AND PRIVATE CAPACITIES.

THE EMBASSY HAS BEEN ASSURED THAT BASE AUTHORITIES ARE MINDFUL OF THE PROVISIONS OF PARAGRAPH 8 OF ARTICLE XIII OF THE MILITARY BASES AGREEMENT PRESERVING AN INJURED PARTY'S CIVIL REMEDIES IN THOSE CASES WHERE THE UNITED STATES EXERCISES ITS CRIMINAL JURISDICTION. THERE IS NO DISPUTE CONCERNING THE VALIDITY OF THOSE PROVISIONS. ESSENTIALLY, THE PURPOSE OF RETURNING THE CIVIL PROCESS TO THE COURT IN THIS CASE WAS RESPECTFULLY TO ADVISE THE COURT THAT THE MILITARY BASE WAS WITHOUT AUTHORITY TO ACCEPT SERVICE ON BEHALF OF THE UNITED STATES GOVERNMENT. ONLY THE EMBASSY HAS SUCH AUTHORITY.
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 MANILA 10853 02 OF 02 140920Z

ADDITIONALLY, THE COURT'S ATTENTION WAS INVITED TO THE FACT THAT ON ITS FACE THE COMPLAINT IS AGAINST THE INDIVIDUALLY NAMED DEFENDANTS ACTING IN THEIR OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS AGENTS AND EMPLOYEES OF THE UNITED STATES GOVERNMENT. THUS, THE ACTION DID NOT APPEAR TO BE DIRECTED AGAINST THE PROPER PARTY DEFENDANT. THIS ADVICE WAS ISSUED PURSUANT TO THE AIRFORCE POLICY OF WORLD-WIDE APPLICABILITY. NONETHELESS, IF THE COURT UPON REFLECTION DOES NOT CONCUR THAT THE NAMED INDIVIDUALS ARE NOT THE PROPER PARTY DEFENDANTS, SERVICE OF PROCESS WILL BE ACCEPTED IN THE USUAL MANNER WITHOUT OBJECTION. IN THE PHILIPPINES SUCH SERVICE WOULD INCLUDE THE ASSISTANCE AND COOPERATION OF THE BASE AUTHORITIES ENVISIONED IN THE UNIQUELY FAVORABLE PROVISIONS OF ARTICLE XIV OF THE MILITARY BASES AGREEMENT TO WHICH THE DEPARTMENT OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS MAKES REFERENCE.

IT MAY BE THAT THE APPARENT MISUNDERSTANDING CONCERNING SERVICE OF PROCESS IN THIS CASE RESULTED FROM INARTFUL WORDING OR INSUFFICIENT CLARITY IN THE LETTER TO THE COURT. IN ANY EVENT, THE EMBASSY WISHES TO CONFIRM TO THE DEPARTMENT THE GOOD FAITH AND INTENTION OF THE UNITED STATES MILITARY TO COMPLY FULLY WITH THEIR OBLIGATIONS UNDER THE MILITARY BASES AGREEMENT.

USUAL COMPLIMENTARY CLOSING. END QUOTE

2. COMMENT: EMBASSY BELIEVES OVERREACTION OF JUSTICE SECRETARY IS BASED ON MISAPPREHENSION OF FACTS AND INTENTIONS WHICH MAY BE SHARED BY COURT. REQUEST

3CSG/JA OR 13THAF/JA CONFIRM THAT FINAL PARAGRAPH IS
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 MANILA 10853 02 OF 02 140920Z

ACCURATE REFLECTION OF FACTS.

3. PLEASE ADVISE SOONEST AS TO ANY MODIFICATIONS
TO ENABLE US TO RESPOND IF POSSIBLE ON 15 JULY BEFORE
WEEKEND HIATUS DESCENDS UPON GOP OFFICIALS.
STULL

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X
Capture Date: 01-Jan-1994 12:00:00 am
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: LITIGATION, MILITARY PERSONNEL, DOGS, POLICIES
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Sent Date: 14-Jul-1977 12:00:00 am
Decaption Date: 01-Jan-1960 12:00:00 am
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 22 May 2009
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1977MANILA10853
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: n/a
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: GS
Errors: N/A
Expiration:
Film Number: D770250-0802
Format: TEL
From: MANILA
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1977/newtext/t19770758/aaaabxxa.tel
Line Count: 183
Litigation Code IDs:
Litigation Codes:
Litigation History:
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Message ID: bb86566b-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Office: ACTION EA
Original Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 4
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: 77 MANILA 10772
Retention: 0
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 13-Oct-2004 12:00:00 am
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review Media Identifier:
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
SAS ID: 1862975
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: PROPOSED REPLY TO DFA PROTEST ON NUGUID CIVIL SUIT
TAGS: MILI, MARR, CGEN, RP, US
To: STATE JUS
Type: TE
vdkgvwkey: odbc://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/bb86566b-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Review Markings:
Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
22 May 2009
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009